

Bahn, V and McGill, B. J. 2013. Testing the predictive performance of distribution models. – *Oikos* 122: 321–331.

## Appendix 1

Table A1. List of papers reviewed evaluating distribution models on fully spatially independent data. Type of split refers to the strategy of separating training from test data in species' distribution data. Data type is presence only (p only), presence/absence (p/a) or abundance (abd). N refers to the number of species included in the study.

Citation	Type of split	Data type	n
Duncan et al. 2009	native vs invasive	p only and p/a	5
Murray et al. 2011	split range	p/a	1
Flojgaard et al. 2009	split range	p/a	7
Barbosa et al. 2009	split range	p/a	1
Arntzen 2006	split range	p/a	38
			22
Merckx et al. 2011	split range	p/a	3
Anderson and Gonzalez 2011	split range	p only	1
Heinänen and von Numers 2009	somewhat segregated second validation set	p/a	5
Fielding and Haworth 1995	split range	p/a	6
Edwards et al. 2006	ind. collected but interspersed	p/a	4
		p only (training)	
Guisan et al. 2007	ind. data, segregated by cell	p/a for testing	30
Lieske and Bender 2011	spatial CV	p/a	5
Sundblad et al. 2009	split range	p/a	2
Gray et al. 2009	split range	p/a	1
Littlewood and Young 2008	split range	p/a	1
Seoane et al. 2005	split range	p/a	10
Peterson 2001	split range	p/a	34
Randin et al. 2006	split range	p/a	54
Peterson et al. 2007	split range	p/a	3
Vanreusel et al. 2007	split range	p/a	2
Bulluck et al. 2006	split range	p/a	18
Freeman et al. 1997	split range	p/a	9
		p only (training)	
Thomas and Bovee 1993	split range	p/a (testing)	1
Graf et al. 2006	split range	p/a	1
Lawler and Edwards Thomas C 2002	split range	p/a	4
Menéndez and Thomas 2006	split range	p/a	1
Vernier et al. 2008	split range	p/a	16
Whittingham et al. 2003	split range	relative abd	1
		p/a training	
Guay et al. 2003	split range	abd testing	1
Leftwich et al. 1997	split range	p/a	1
Whittingham et al. 2007	split range	p/a	11
McAlpine et al. 2008	split range	p/a	1

Table A2. List of species included in the models.

<u>Genus</u>	<u>Species</u>	<u>Common name</u>
<i>Cathartes</i>	<i>aura</i>	turkey vulture
<i>Colinus</i>	<i>virginianus</i>	northern bobwhite
<i>Zenaida</i>	<i>macroura</i>	mourning dove
<i>Coccyzus</i>	<i>americanus</i>	yellow-billed cuckoo
<i>Chordeiles</i>	<i>minor</i>	common nighthawk
<i>Chaetura</i>	<i>pelagica</i>	chimney swift
<i>Archilochus</i>	<i>colubris</i>	ruby-throated hummingbird
<i>Melanerpes</i>	<i>erythrocephalus</i>	red-headed woodpecker
<i>Melanerpes</i>	<i>carolinus</i>	red-bellied woodpecker
<i>Picoides</i>	<i>pubescens</i>	downy woodpecker
<i>Picoides</i>	<i>villosus</i>	hairy woodpecker
<i>Colaptes</i>	<i>auratus</i>	northern flicker
<i>Dryocopus</i>	<i>pileatus</i>	pileated woodpecker
<i>Contopus</i>	<i>virens</i>	eastern wood-pewee
<i>Empidonax</i>	<i>traillii</i>	willow flycatcher
<i>Empidonax</i>	<i>minimus</i>	least flycatcher
<i>Sayornis</i>	<i>phoebe</i>	eastern phoebe
<i>Myiarchus</i>	<i>crinitus</i>	great crested flycatcher
<i>Tyrannus</i>	<i>tyrannus</i>	eastern kingbird
<i>Lanius</i>	<i>ludovicianus</i>	loggerhead shrike
<i>Vireo</i>	<i>griseus</i>	white-eyed vireo
<i>Vireo</i>	<i>flavifrons</i>	yellow-throated vireo
<i>Vireo</i>	<i>gilvus</i>	warbling vireo
<i>Vireo</i>	<i>olivaceus</i>	red-eyed vireo
<i>Cyanocitta</i>	<i>cristata</i>	blue jay
<i>Corvus</i>	<i>brachyrhynchus</i>	American crow
<i>Corvus</i>	<i>corax</i>	common raven
<i>Eremophila</i>	<i>alpestris</i>	horned lark
<i>Progne</i>	<i>subis</i>	purple martin
<i>Tachycineta</i>	<i>bicolour</i>	tree swallow
<i>Petrochelidon</i>	<i>pyrrhonota</i>	cliff swallow
<i>Hirundo</i>	<i>rustica</i>	barn swallow
<i>Poecile</i>	<i>carolinensis</i>	Carolina chickadee
<i>Poecile</i>	<i>atricapillus</i>	black-capped chickadee
<i>Baeolophus</i>	<i>bicolour</i>	tufted titmouse
<i>Sitta</i>	<i>canadensis</i>	red-breasted nuthatch
<i>Sitta</i>	<i>carolinensis</i>	white-breasted nuthatch
<i>Thryothorus</i>	<i>ludovicianus</i>	Carolina wren
<i>Troglodytes</i>	<i>aedon</i>	house wren
<i>Poliophtila</i>	<i>caerulea</i>	blue-gray gnatcatcher
<i>Sialia</i>	<i>sialis</i>	eastern bluebird
<i>Hylocichla</i>	<i>mustelina</i>	wood thrush
<i>Turdus</i>	<i>migratorius</i>	American robin
<i>Dumetella</i>	<i>carolinensis</i>	gray catbird
<i>Mimus</i>	<i>polyglottos</i>	northern mockingbird
<i>Toxostoma</i>	<i>rufum</i>	brown thrasher
<i>Sturnus</i>	<i>vulgaris</i>	European starling
<i>Bombycilla</i>	<i>cedrorum</i>	cedar waxwing
<i>Parula</i>	<i>americana</i>	northern parula

<i>Dendroica</i>	<i>petechia</i>	yellow warbler
<i>Mniotilta</i>	<i>varia</i>	black-and-white warbler
<i>Setophaga</i>	<i>ruticilla</i>	American redstart
<i>Seiurus</i>	<i>aurocapilla</i>	ovenbird
<i>Geothlypis</i>	<i>trichas</i>	common yellowthroat
<i>Icteria</i>	<i>virens</i>	yellow-breasted chat
<i>Piranga</i>	<i>olivacea</i>	scarlet tanager
<i>Pipilo</i>	<i>erythrophthalmus</i>	eastern towhee
<i>Spizella</i>	<i>passerine</i>	chipping sparrow
<i>Spizella</i>	<i>pusilla</i>	field sparrow
<i>Poocetes</i>	<i>gramineus</i>	vesper sparrow
<i>Passerculus</i>	<i>sandwichensis</i>	savannah sparrow
<i>Ammodramus</i>	<i>savannarum</i>	grasshopper sparrow
<i>Melospiza</i>	<i>melodia</i>	song sparrow
<i>Cardinalis</i>	<i>cardinalis</i>	northern cardinal
<i>Pheucticus</i>	<i>ludovicianus</i>	rose-breasted grosbeak
<i>Passerina</i>	<i>caerulea</i>	blue grosbeak
<i>Passerina</i>	<i>cyanea</i>	indigo bunting
<i>Dolichonyx</i>	<i>oryzivorus</i>	bobolink
<i>Agelaius</i>	<i>phoeniceus</i>	red-winged blackbird
<i>Sturnella</i>	<i>magna</i>	eastern meadowlark
<i>Sturnella</i>	<i>neglecta</i>	western meadowlark
<i>Euphagus</i>	<i>cyanocephalus</i>	Brewer's blackbird
<i>Quiscalus</i>	<i>quiscula</i>	common grackle
<i>Molothrus</i>	<i>ater</i>	brown-headed cowbird
<i>Icterus</i>	<i>spurius</i>	orchard oriole
<i>Icterus</i>	<i>galbula</i>	Baltimore oriole
<i>Carpodacus</i>	<i>mexicanus</i>	house finch
<i>Carduelis</i>	<i>tristis</i>	American goldfinch
<i>Passer</i>	<i>domesticus</i>	house sparrow

## References

- Anderson, R. P. and Gonzalez, I. 2011. Species-specific tuning increases robustness to sampling bias in models of species distributions: an implementation with Maxent. – *Ecol. Modell.* 222: 2796–2811.
- Arntzen, J. 2006. From descriptive to predictive distribution models: a working example with Iberian amphibians and reptiles. – *Front. Zool.* 3: 8.
- Barbosa, A. M. et al. 2009. Transferability of environmental favourability models in geographic space: the case of the Iberian desman (*Galemys pyrenaicus*) in Portugal and Spain. – *Ecol. Modell.* 220: 747–754.
- Bulluck, L. et al. 2006. Spatial and temporal variations in species occurrence rate affect the accuracy of occurrence models. – *Global Ecol. Biogeogr.* 15: 27–38.
- Duncan, R. P. et al. 2009. Do climate envelope models transfer? A manipulative test using dung beetle introductions. – *Proc. R. Soc. B* 276: 1449–1457.
- Edwards, J. T. C. et al. 2006. Effects of sample survey design on the accuracy of classification tree models in species distribution models. – *Ecol. Modell.* 199: 132–141.
- Fielding, A. H. and Haworth, P. F. 1995. Testing the generality of bird-habitat models. – *Conserv. Biol.* 9: 1466–1481.
- Flojgaard, C. et al. 2009. Ice age distributions of European small mammals: insights from species distribution modelling. – *J. Biogeogr.* 36: 1152–1163.
- Freeman, M. C. et al. 1997. Transferability of habitat suitability criteria for fishes in warmwater streams. – *N. Am. J. Fish. Manage.* 17: 20–31.
- Graf, R. F. et al. 2006. On the generality of habitat distribution models: a case study of capercaillie in three Swiss regions. – *Ecography* 29: 319–328.
- Gray, T. N. E. et al. 2009. Generality of models that predict the distribution of species: conservation activity and reduction of model transferability for a threatened bustard. – *Conserv. Biol.* 23: 433–439.
- Guay, J. C. et al. 2003. Assessment of the transferability of biological habitat models for Atlantic salmon parr (*Salmo salar*). – *Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci.* 60: 1398–1408.
- Guisan, A. et al. 2007. What matters for predicting the occurrences of trees: techniques, data, or species' characteristics? – *Ecol. Monogr.* 77: 615–630.
- Heinänen, S. and von Numers, M. 2009. Modelling species distribution in complex environments: an evaluation of predictive ability and reliability in five shorebird species. – *Divers. Distrib.* 15: 266–279.
- Lawler, J. J. and Edwards Thomas C, Jr. 2002. Landscape patterns as habitat predictors:

- building and testing models for cavity-nesting birds in the Uinta Mountains of Utah, USA. – *Landscape Ecol.* 17: 233–245.
- Leftwich, K. N. et al. 1997. Factors influencing behavior and transferability of habitat models for a benthic stream fish. – *Trans. Am. Fish. Soc.* 126: 725–734.
- Lieske, D. J. and Bender, D. J. 2011. A robust test of spatial predictive models: geographic cross-validation. – *J. Environ. Inf.* 17: 91–101.
- Littlewood, N. A. and Young, M. R. 2008. A habitat suitability model for the narrow-headed ant, *Formica exsecta*, evaluated against independent data. – *Insect. Conserv. Divers.* 1: 108–113.
- McAlpine, C. A. et al. 2008. Can multiscale models of species' distribution be generalized from region to region? A case study of the koala. – *J. Appl. Ecol.* 45: 558–567.
- Menéndez, R. and Thomas, C. 2006. Can occupancy patterns be used to predict distributions in widely separated geographic regions? – *Oecologia* 149: 396–405.
- Merckx, B. et al. 2011. Null models reveal preferential sampling, spatial autocorrelation and overfitting in habitat suitability modelling. – *Ecol. Modell.* 222: 588–597.
- Murray, J. V. et al. 2011. Evaluating model transferability for a threatened species to adjacent areas: implications for rock-wallaby conservation. – *Austral Ecol.* 36: 76–89.
- Peterson, A. T. 2001. Predicting species' geographic distributions based on ecological niche modeling. – *Condor* 103: 599–605.
- Peterson, T. A. et al. 2007. Transferability and model evaluation in ecological niche modeling: a comparison of GARP and Maxent. – *Ecography* 30: 550–560.
- Randin, C. F. et al. 2006. Are niche-based species distribution models transferable in space? – *J. Biogeogr.* 33: 1689–1703.
- Seoane, J. et al. 2005. Effect of expert opinion on the predictive ability of environmental models of bird distribution. – *Conserv. Biol.* 19: 512–522.
- Sundblad, G. et al. 2009. Transferability of predictive fish distribution models in two coastal systems. – *Estuarine Coastal Shelf Sci.* 83: 90–96.
- Thomas, J. A. and Bovee, K. D. 1993. Application and testing of a procedure to evaluate transferability of habitat suitability criteria. – *Regulated Rivers Res. Manage.* 8: 285–294.
- Vanreusel, W. et al. 2007. Transferability of species distribution models: a functional habitat approach for two regionally threatened butterflies. – *Conserv. Biol.* 21: 201–212.
- Vernier, P. R. et al. 2008. Generalizability of songbird habitat models in boreal mixedwood forests of Alberta. – *Ecol. Modell.* 211: 191–201.

Whittingham, M. J. et al. 2007. Should conservation strategies consider spatial generality?

Farmland birds show regional not national patterns of habitat association. – *Ecol. Lett.* 10: 25–35.

Whittingham, M. J. et al. 2003. Do habitat association models have any generality? Predicting

skylark *Alauda arvensis* abundance in different regions of southern England. – *Ecography* 26: 521–531.